

Proof of Fact 1. Looking at right triangle BDE , we have $DE = (BD) \tan \alpha$, where $\alpha = \angle DBE$, or

$$x = (1 - y) \tan \alpha. \quad (3)$$

From triangle ACB and the law of sines, we have

$$\sin(\theta + \alpha) = \frac{y + 2r}{2r} \sin \theta, \quad (4)$$

so that $\alpha = \sin^{-1} \left(\left(1 + \frac{y}{2r}\right) \sin \theta - \theta \right)$. This gives

$$x = (1 - y) \tan \left(\sin^{-1} \left(\left(1 + \frac{y}{2r}\right) \sin \theta - \theta \right) \right).$$

Proof of Fact 2. For this we need just the usual approximations:

$$u \approx \sin u \approx \tan u \approx \sin^{-1} u, \text{ for } u \rightarrow 0.$$

Proof of Fact 3. $\left(\frac{(1-y)y}{2r} \theta \right)$ is quadratic in y with its maximum at the average of its

zeros, namely, $y = 1/2$.

Proof of Fact 4. Let α_k denote the angle of deflection of the k 'th ball after it is contacted by the $(k - 1)$ 'st, where the cue ball is the 0'th ball. The following are easy to verify:

$$\begin{array}{ll}
 \frac{x}{1 - y_n} = \tan \alpha_n & \alpha_n \approx \frac{x}{1 - y_n} \\
 \sin(\alpha_n + \alpha_{n-1}) = (y_n - y_{n-1}) \frac{\sin \alpha_{n-1}}{2r} & \alpha_n + \alpha_{n-1} \approx \frac{y_n - y_{n-1}}{2r} \alpha_{n-1} \\
 \vdots & \vdots \\
 \sin(\alpha_k + \alpha_{k-1}) = (y_k - y_{k-1}) \frac{\sin \alpha_{k-1}}{2r} & \alpha_k + \alpha_{k-1} \approx \frac{y_k - y_{k-1}}{2r} \alpha_{k-1} \\
 \vdots & \vdots \\
 \sin(\alpha_2 + \alpha_1) = (y_2 - y_1) \frac{\sin \alpha_1}{2r} & \alpha_2 + \alpha_1 \approx \frac{y_2 - y_1}{2r} \alpha_1 \\
 \sin(\alpha_1 + \theta) = (y_1 + 2r) \frac{\sin \theta}{2r} & \alpha_1 + \theta \approx \frac{y_1 + 2r}{2r} \theta.
 \end{array}$$

Solving gives $x \approx (1 - y_n) \left(\frac{y_n - y_{n-1} - 2r}{2r} \right) \dots \left(\frac{y_2 - y_1 - 2r}{2r} \right) \left(\frac{y_1}{2r} \right) \theta$. Letting $z_{n+1} = 1 - y_n$, $z_k = y_k - y_{k-1} - 2r$ (for $1 < k < n$) and $z_1 = y_1$, we want to maximize $z_1 z_2 \dots z_{n+1}$ subject to $z_1 + z_2 + \dots + z_{n+1} = 1 - 2r$. This is standard (by Lagrange multipliers, say) resulting in

$$z_1 = z_2 = \dots = z_{n+1} = \frac{1 - 2r}{n + 1}.$$



Proof of Fact 5. Holding θ and r constant, let $f(y) = x(y, \theta, r)$ and differentiate (3) and (4) with respect to y to get

$$f'(y) = -\tan \alpha + (1 - y) \sec^2 \alpha \frac{d\alpha}{dy}$$

and

$$\frac{d\alpha}{dy} = \frac{\sin \theta}{2r} \sec(\theta + \alpha).$$

Differentiating each once more gives

$$f''(y) = -2 \sec^2 \alpha \frac{d\alpha}{dy} + (1 - y) \sec^2 \alpha \left(2 \tan \alpha \left(\frac{d\alpha}{dy} \right)^2 + \frac{d^2 \alpha}{dy^2} \right)$$

and

$$\frac{d^2 \alpha}{dy^2} = \frac{\sin \theta}{2r} \sec(\alpha + \theta) \tan(\alpha + \theta) \frac{d\alpha}{dy}.$$

Combining these gives

$$\frac{d^2 x}{dy^2} = \frac{d\alpha}{dy} (\sec^2 \alpha) (-2 + \mathcal{J}),$$

where

$$\mathcal{J} = (1 - y) \frac{\sin \theta}{2r} \sec(\alpha + \theta) (2 \tan \alpha + \tan(\alpha + \theta)).$$

We'll show that $\mathcal{J} < 3/2$, which will prove that $f''(y) < 0$.
Since $\tan \alpha < \tan(\alpha + \theta)$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \sec(\alpha + \theta)(2 \tan \alpha + \tan(\alpha + \theta)) &< 3 \sec(\alpha + \theta) \tan(\alpha + \theta) \\ &= \frac{3 \sin(\alpha + \theta)}{1 - \sin^2(\alpha + \theta)} \\ &= \frac{3(\sin \theta)(1 + \frac{y}{2r})}{1 - (\sin^2 \theta)(1 + \frac{y}{2r})^2}. \end{aligned}$$

This implies that

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{J} &< \frac{(1-y)}{2r} \frac{3 \left(\frac{2r}{1+2r}\right)^2 \left(1 + \frac{y}{2r}\right)}{1 - \left(\frac{2r}{1+2r}\right)^2 \left(1 + \frac{y}{2r}\right)^2} \\ &= \frac{3(2r+y)}{1+4r+y} \\ &< \frac{3}{2}. \end{aligned}$$

8

Proof of Fact 6. $f(y)$ has a unique maximum for $0 \leq y \leq 1$, since $f(0) = f(1) = 0$ and $f''(y) < 0$ on this interval. By showing $f'(1/2) > 0$, it will follow that this maximum occurs for $1/2 < y < 1$.

We've already noted (implicitly) the dependence of α on y , but let's set $y = 1/2$ in (4) to get

$$\sin(\alpha + \theta) = (\sin \theta) \left(1 + \frac{1}{4r}\right),$$

and continue to write α for the specific value of α so obtained (which still depends on the fixed values of θ and r). Using the fact that $\sec^2 \alpha > \sec \alpha$, our formula for $f'(y)$ from a previous napkin gives

$$\begin{aligned} f'(1/2) &> -\tan \alpha + \frac{1}{4r} \sec \alpha \sin \theta \sec(\alpha + \theta) \\ &= \sec \alpha (-\sin \alpha + (\sin(\alpha + \theta) - \sin \theta) \sec(\alpha + \theta)) \\ &= \sec \alpha \sec(\alpha + \theta) \cdot \mathcal{L}, \end{aligned}$$

where $\mathcal{L} = \sin(\alpha + \theta) - \sin \alpha \cos(\alpha + \theta) - \sin \theta$. We're done if $\mathcal{L} > 0$.

We note that $\mathcal{L} = 0$ for $\alpha = 0$, so we'll be done if $\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial \alpha} > 0$. And indeed,

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial \alpha} &= \cos(\alpha + \theta) - \cos \alpha \cos(\alpha + \theta) + \sin \alpha \sin(\alpha + \theta) \\ &> \cos(\alpha + \theta) - \cos(\alpha + \theta) + \sin \alpha \sin(\alpha + \theta) \\ &= \sin \alpha \sin(\alpha + \theta) \\ &> 0. \end{aligned}$$



Proof of Fact 7. We want to show that $f'(0) < -f'(1)$. Letting $a = 1/(2r)$, this translates into proving that $a \tan \theta < \tan((\sin^{-1}((a+1)\sin \theta) - \theta))$, or

$$\tan^{-1}(a \tan \theta) + \theta < \sin^{-1}((a+1)\sin \theta). \quad (5)$$

Note that $a > 1$ and that $(a+1)\sin \theta > 1$ (our condition of the maximum angle). Both sides of the inequality in (5) are zero for $\theta = 0$, so we are finished if the inequality holds when differentiated. That is, we are done if we can show that


$$1 + \frac{a \sec^2 \theta}{1 + a^2 \tan^2 \theta} < \frac{(a+1) \cos \theta}{\sqrt{1 - (a+1)^2 \sin^2 \theta}}. \quad (6)$$

Squaring both sides, cross-multiplying, then gathering everything to the right (brute-force here; I won't say if I had any electronic assistance), our inequality in (6) is true if

$$a^2 \sin^2 \theta (3 - (a^2 + 2a + 3) \sin^2 \theta) > 0.$$

Again using the fact that $\sin \theta < \frac{1}{a+1}$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} 3 - (a^2 + 2a + 3) \sin^2 \theta &> 3 - \frac{a^2 + 2a + 3}{(a+1)^2} \\ &= \frac{2a(a+2)}{(a+1)^2}, \end{aligned}$$

which is positive, so we're done. 

Proof of Fact 8. Since $f(1-y) > f(y) \Leftrightarrow \frac{f(1-y)}{y(1-y)} > \frac{f(y)}{y(1-y)}$, by defining $g(y) = \frac{f(y)}{y(1-y)}$, it suffices then to show that g is increasing on $[0, 1/2]$. Using $\sin(\theta + \alpha) = (1 + \frac{y}{2r}) \sin \theta$, or $\sin(\theta + \alpha) - \sin \theta = \frac{y}{2r} \sin \theta$, and $\sin \theta \leq \frac{2r}{y+2r}$, we have,

$$\begin{aligned}
 g'(y) &= \frac{f'(y)}{y(1-y)} + \frac{f(y)(2y-1)}{y^2(1-y)^2} \\
 &= \frac{-y \tan \alpha + y(1-y)(\sec^2 \alpha) \frac{\sin \theta}{r} \sec(\theta + \alpha) + (2y-1) \tan \alpha}{y^2(1-y)} \\
 &= \frac{y \sec^2 \alpha \frac{\sin \theta}{r} \sec(\theta + \alpha) - \tan \alpha}{y^2} \\
 &= \frac{\sec^2 \alpha (\sin(\theta + \alpha) - \sin \theta) \sec(\theta + \alpha) - \tan \alpha}{y^2} \\
 &> \frac{(\sin(\theta + \alpha) - \sin \theta) \sec(\theta + \alpha) - \tan \alpha}{y^2} \\
 &= \frac{\sec \alpha \sec(\theta + \alpha)}{y^2} ((\sin(\theta + \alpha) - \sin \theta) \cos \alpha - \cos(\theta + \alpha) \sin \alpha) \\
 &= \frac{\sec \alpha \sec(\theta + \alpha)}{y^2} \sin \theta (1 - \cos \alpha) \\
 &> 0.
 \end{aligned}$$



Proof of Fact 9. For each fixed $r \in (0, 1/2)$ and $y \in (0, 1)$, the maximum value of x is

$$x\left(y, \sin^{-1} \frac{2r}{1+2r}, r\right) = (1-y) \tan \left(\sin^{-1} \left(\frac{y+2r}{1+2r} \right) - \sin^{-1} \left(\frac{2r}{1+2r} \right) \right).$$

Letting $r \rightarrow 0$ in the above gives

$$(1-y) \frac{y}{\sqrt{1-y^2}},$$

a quantity which is zero when $y = 0$ and for $y \rightarrow 1$, and which is otherwise positive. The derivative of this quantity is

$$\frac{-(1-y)(y^2+y-1)}{(1-y^2)^{3/2}},$$

which has as its single zero in $(0, 1)$ the number we desire.

Our work here is done. Shoot.

